EQUITABLE COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT
BEFORE, DURING AND AFTER COVID-19
SHOULD WE BE DOING PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT RIGHT NOW?

OR IS NOW MORE IMPORTANT THAN EVER?

Have honest conversations.
  – Adapt message to acknowledge crisis and expand opportunities to engage meaningfully.

Redefine success.
  – Stay relevant, listen, and roll out strategies over time, recognizing the uncertainty and not jumping to conclusions. We may not have the answers right now.

Acknowledge ALL the divides.
  – Addressing digital, racial, social, economic and age barriers
WE DON’T HAVE ALL THE ANSWERS
OR EVEN THE RIGHT QUESTIONS. BUT TO ADAPT, WE NEED TO ASK MORE OF THEM.

- What role does community engagement need to play in planning and development?
- Who needs to be heard/represented who isn’t?
- What do we mean by equitable engagement?
- Can any engagement be equitable right now?
- Will COVID forever change the way we engage?
- Is our profession structured to connect authentically?
- What different tools do we need? Are we too focused on tools?
- What should be our metrics of success?
AGENDA

30 MINUTES SPEAKERS
30 MINUTES – DISCUSSION / Q&A

KATHLEEN DUFFY, AICP
Engagement Pre-COVID-19

UJIIJI DAVIS, PLA
Engagement During COVID-19

JANET ATTARIAN, AIA
Moving Forward
ENGAGEMENT PRE-COVID-19

WHAT WORKED? WHAT DIDN’T?
HOW CAN WE ADAPT OUR PROCESS TO BE MORE EQUITABLE?

KATHLEEN DUFFY, AICP
INCLUSIVE PROCESS
FRAMEWORK FOR DECISION-MAKING

Foundations
- Education
- Data Gathering
- Plan Review

Visioning
- Values & Goals
- Scenario Foundations

Exploration
- Objectives
- Alternative Ideas

Choices
- Evaluation
- Plan Direction

Action
- Implementation

ENGAGEMENT
ENGAGEMENT AT THE CORE OF THE PROCESS

KEYS TO SUCCESS

- Grounded in facts
- Build shared knowledge
- Leverage best practices

- Community understanding
- Collaborative decision-making
- How and why decisions are made

- Get all the voices to the table
- Building ownership in the process
- Go to the people

DEFENSIBLE

TRANSPARENT

INCLUSIVE

Equitable Engagement
### Project: Euclid Corridor Redevelopment

#### MEETING TYPE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ORGANIZATION</th>
<th>Core Team (calls)</th>
<th>Team Meetings</th>
<th>Stakeholder Interview</th>
<th>Stakeholder Focus Group</th>
<th>Community Meeting</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Business Focused Organization</strong></td>
<td>Chamber of Commerce</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Economic development agency</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Major employers</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>General business community</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Community Development</strong></td>
<td>Housing focused groups</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Workforce development</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Private, active developers</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Historical Society</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Community Foundation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

- **What do we need to hear?**
- **Who are we trying to reach?**
- **Are we asking the right questions?**
- **Not just about deploying a number of tools and techniques and checking boxes**
LEVELS OF ENGAGEMENT

What are the challenges for engaging during physical distancing?

One-Way Communication:
Requires people to self-select to engage

Two-way Communication:
How do we overcome physical distancing to effectively collaborate?

Adapted from: International Association for Public Participation www.iap2.org
• Social media blasts
• Educational resources
• Best practices expert panels and presentations

INFORM

PROVIDE THE PUBLIC BALANCED AND OBJECTIVE INFORMATION TO ASSIST THEM IN UNDERSTANDING THE PROBLEM, ALTERNATIVES, OPPORTUNITIES, AND/OR SOLUTIONS.

LISTEN

INVOLVE

COLLABORATE

Equitable Engagement

smithgroup.com
LISTEN

OBTAINT FEEDBACK ON ANALYSIS, ALTERNATIVES, AND/OR DECISIONS. LISTEN AND ACKNOWLEDGE CONCERNS AND ASPIRATIONS AND PROVIDE FEEDBACK ON HOW PUBLIC INPUT INFLUENCED THE DECISION.

- ArcGIS Hub Site
  - One stop shop
  - Mobile-friendly
  - Mapping input
  - Survey with real-time results

- Replicate in-person sticky notes, map dots, and comment cards

connectingtherouge.org
INVOLVE

Work with public to ensure concerns and aspirations are understood and considered and directly reflected in alternatives. Provide feedback on how public input influenced the decision.

- Focus groups
- Priority voting on alternatives
- Charrettes
- Las Vegas Mini-Workshops
  - National + local expert led best practices
  - Strategy building with key implementors
  - Intersection based on cross-cutting guiding principles
**WORKSHOPS**

**CHICAGO SOUTH LAKEFRONT FRAMEWORK PLAN**

- Pre-COVID-19, it took a lot of effort to get this response
- Online charrettes can even increase participation because of on-demand options in place of set meetings – but who is still left out?
PUBLIC WORKSHOPS – IN REALITY

COMMON WOES WE’VE ALL SHARED

- Too often...
  - Check the box
  - Meet the minimum requirements to meet expectations

- Low attendance
  - Hard to get an actual cross section of the population
  - Louder voices dominate (and represent the few)
  - Silent majority usually supportive, people only come out when they're against something
GO WHERE THE PEOPLE ARE

INCLUSIVE ENGAGEMENT TECHNIQUES

- DIY Workshop Kits
  - Collages
  - Precedents
  - Mapping
- Survey
  - Online
  - Textizen
  - Paper surveys
- Piggyback on established events
- Pop-up workshops
- Focus groups and interviews
- Social media - bite size content and notices
- Online web portals (including mapping)
BARRIERS: DIGITAL DIVIDE

81%

U.S. adults who have a smartphone

73%

U.S. adults who have a home broadband
BARRIERS: DIGITAL DIVIDE

17%

U.S. adults who have a smartphone and no home broadband

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Younger</th>
<th>Less educated</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18-29</td>
<td>HS or less</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30-49</td>
<td>Some college</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50-64</td>
<td>College+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65+</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Urban/Rural</th>
<th>People of Color</th>
<th>Lower earners</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Less than $30,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suburban</td>
<td>Black</td>
<td>$30,000-$74,999</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>Hispanic</td>
<td>$75,000 or more</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Pew Research Center, June 2019, “Mobile Technology and Home Broadband 2019”
COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT IN THE TIME OF COVID-19

HOW WE HAVE ADAPTED OUR PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT STRATEGIES DURING THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC

UJIIJI DAVIS, PLA
PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT PRE-COVID

- Rooted in face-to-face conversation and in-person reflections
- Builds rapport and trust with residents and stakeholders
- Opportunity to answer questions and concerns in real time
- Different approaches to learning (kinetic, visual, auditory, etc.)
COVID-19 IMPACT

- The State of Michigan observed a state-wide lock down for 3 months, being among the top 3 states with the highest number of cases and COVID-related deaths.
- Disproportionate impact with Michigan elderly and Black residents, who make up majority of our engagement sessions.
- A national State of Emergency declared mid-March.
- Moving forward, more precautions:
  - Social distancing requirements
  - Restrictions on mass gatherings
  - Face coverings required

Photo: University of Michigan
SHELTERING IN PLACE

- A mass shift to virtual meetings and conferencing
  - Building trust with our clients – letting them know we can adapt!
  - Providing options for materials (from print to digital)
  - Being proactive about ZOOM Bombing and other predatory trends
  - Exposure to digital divide and finding ways to respond

Photo: Zoom Meetings
The recent protests against police brutality and the widespread awareness of the Movement for Black Lives has reignited historic discussion on the disproportionate impact of improvements to the built environment.
VIRTUAL PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT

ONLINE SURVEY

- Launched May 21
- Over 1200 responses to date
- Mailed paper surveys with stamped return envelopes - to capture respondents without internet access

DSO Sosnick Courtyard Design Survey

The DSO Sosnick Courtyard Design survey - 3 minutes

Music is courageous, unifying, powerful, calming and it can't be silenced in times of uncertainty. At a moment when organizations are being tested like never before, we are even more grateful for your support as a patron and friend of the Detroit Symphony Orchestra, because it is your belief in the DSO that will enable us to emerge from these uncertain times resilient and ready to serve our community with even greater purpose.

This anonymous survey will assist the DSO in re-imagining ways to activate its Sosnick Courtyard, a gathering and performance green space adjacent to the Max M. and Marjorie S. Fisher Music Center. The data collected in this survey will help develop design ideas to create a new, dynamic, and accessible green space to benefit our community - DSO patrons, neighbors, and local businesses. This survey, conducted via SurveyGizmo, will take approximately 3 minutes to complete. Please complete by May 25, 2020. Your time and feedback are greatly appreciated.
Online survey to collect quantitative and qualitative data
- 50% of respondents are 61 years or older
- 66% of respondents use the DSO Parking Deck for events
- Majority drive to the DSO

- These responses help us understand
  - Arrival experience
  - Supporting infrastructure
  - Accessibility to the site by considering patron ages
  - Appropriate daily programs
VIRTUAL PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT

ONLINE SURVEY

- Survey also provides opportunities to share specific comments
- These responses help us understand
  - Experience
  - Wayfinding recommendations
  - Visibility and Site Identity

8. Were you able to find the entrance to the building easily?

- 98% SAY YES

You no longer have access off the side street which is a problem for my partner who can't walk long distances, especially in bad weather. I have a neighbor who has given up on concerts because of this.

Parking downtown or Midtown is often terrible.

Actually, I followed the crowd. Had there not been a crowd, not sure how well I would have found the entrance from parking.

I'm easily distracted. I need a direct sign, "enter here!". If I'm at the wrong entrance I need a map. I'm probably the minority.

It's too far from the parking structure for seniors or handicapped patrons. Valet parking only decreases the walk by a small amount. Coffee concert or Sunday matinee patrons aren't even given the option of valet.
VIRTUAL PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT

INTERACTIVE WEBSITE

- www.dso-sosnick-courtyard.com
- Online portal to share updates and solicit feedback
  - Online portal to share updates and solicit feedback
  - Post-it Comments
  - Link to online survey
- Benefits:
  - Measurable interactivity to website to adapt outreach
  - Provides an opportunity for respondents to engage beyond the survey and forum series
  - Offers tangible goals to support the design narrative
  - Zoom Meetings uploaded for transparency
VIRTUAL PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT

VIRTUAL PUBLIC FORUM

- One hour each topic, about 15-20 participants per session
- Discussed core design themes:
  - Accessibility and ADA Access
  - Community Engagement
  - Space Activation and Experience
  - Programming
- These responses help us understand:
  - Desired design elements
    - Water fountains, tables and chairs, lawn, trees etc.
  - Programs our neighbors want to see
    - New collaboration opportunities with other Detroit organizations
    - Youth and teen development
    - Family events
VIRTUAL PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT

CONFERENCE RULES

• Please keep your audio on mute during the session. We want to make sure that everyone can hear the information and each other.

• There is a feature to “Raise Your Hand” in the participants dialogue box. When we break for the Open Dialogue, we will call on people who have their hands raised digitally.

• We may not be able to hear from everybody so please use the Chat option to add comments or questions and they will be read and answered aloud.

• If on phone only, use *6 to mute/unmute and *9 to raise hand.

• For more information, please visit the DSO’s website at www.DSO.org or the Sosnick Courtyard page for periodic updates at www.dso-sosnick-courtyard.com
EVENT IDEAS

Café in the Court

Art & Music

Music in the Court

Yoga with the Court

Movies in the Court

Host is sharing poll results

1. What sort of event programming would you most like to attend?

   a. Musical Performance (Concerts, DSO simulcast, small ensembles) 53%
   b. Fair or Market (Art, Music, Farmer’s Market) 18%
   c. Outdoor dining (café, food trucks, cocktail events) 12%
   d. Outdoor recreation and health (e.g. yoga classes) 0%
   e. Outdoor Movie Night 12%
   f. Seasonal Community Events (e.g. Noel Night) 0%
   g. Other 6%
PRELIMINARY DESIGN CONCEPTS – 4 BIG IDEAS
EACH A KIT OF PARTS THAT CAN BE ADDED UPON
MOVING FORWARD

WHAT’S NEXT? HOW CAN WE ADAPT OUR TOOLKIT TO BE MORE EQUITABLE?

JANET ATTARIAN, AIA
WILL COVID FOREVER CHANGE THE WAY WE ENGAGE?

A CRISIS is a *turning point*

But a crisis also opens the door to renegotiate the terms of engagement.

Success will be determined by our ability to align with people’s needs.
The Vision:

WHAT DOES EFFECTIVE COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT REQUIRE?
HOW DO WE BUILD THE FOUNDATION?

TRUST

A HEALTHY AND BEAUTIFUL DETROIT, BUILT ON INCLUSIONARY GROWTH, ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY, AND AN ATMOSPHERE OF TRUST.

LETS DREAM TOGETHER

WHAT'S YOUR VISION FOR THE JOE LOUIS GREENWAY?
WHAT SHOULD EFFECTIVE COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT ACHIEVE?

GOING BEYOND COLLABORATION

INFORM -> LISTEN -> INVOLVE -> COLLABORATE -> EMPOWER

—If empowerment if the goal, how does each strategy support this effort?

—What do we do about structural empowerment imbalances?
WHAT SHOULD EFFECTIVE COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT ACHIEVE?

PARTICIPATION AND TACTICAL URBANISM

EMPOWERMENT
WHAT SHOULD EFFECTIVE COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT ACHIEVE?

RESILIENCE
WHAT ROLE MIGHT THE PROFESSION PLAY?

ADVOCATE VS FACILITATOR
CAN ANY ENGAGEMENT BE EQUITABLE RIGHT NOW?

QUESTIONING OUR ASSUMPTIONS

Equality

Equity

© 2023 SmithGroup. All rights reserved.
CAN ANY ENGAGEMENT BE EQUITABLE RIGHT NOW?

—Both assume they are starting on the same road that is in the same condition

—Both assume everyone knows how to ride a bike

—Everyone wants to ride a bike
MEETING PEOPLE WHERE THEY ARE


Notes: 2016 dollars. No comparable data are available between 1963 and 1983. Black/Hispanic distinction within nonwhite population available only in 1983 and later.
QUESTIONING ASSUMPTIONS

ASKERS CLOCK VS TELLERS CLOCK
DIGITAL ENGAGEMENT AS OPPORTUNITY

BLENDED TOOL KIT FOR A MORE CONTINUOUS ENGAGEMENT PROCESS

- Creating a continuous conversation
- Increasing convenience
- New Technologies
- Continuous quick and easy check-ins

TYPES OF TECHNOLOGY USED

- Textizen
  - Text Message Based
- mindmixer
  - Virtual Town Hall
- SurveyMonkey
  - Web based survey

DEMOGRAPHICS, BY SURVEY TYPE

Age Range by Survey Type

- Demo
- 25-34
- 35-44
- 45-54
- 55-64
- 65+

- Phone survey results
- Text survey results
Everything we do during and after this crisis must be with a strong focus on building more equal, inclusive and sustainable economies and societies that are more resilient in the face of pandemics, climate change, and the many other global challenges we face.

António Guterres

António Guterres is the ninth Secretary-General of the United Nations, who took office on 1st January 2017.
DISCUSSION/Q&A

KATHLEEN DUFFY, AICP
Kathleen.Duffy@smithgroup.com

UJJJI DAVIS, PLA
Ujjji.Davis@smithgroup.com

JANET ATTARIAN, AIA
Janet.Attarian@smithgroup.com
THANK YOU!